

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING
FOR THE CORRECTIONS OFFICER RETIREMENT PLAN LOCAL BOARD
FOR THE SUPERIOR COURT**

A Public Meeting of the Corrections Officer Retirement Plan Local Board for the Superior Court was convened Tuesday, December 6, 2016, at 10:00 a.m., Conference Room 109, Arizona State Courts Building, 1501 West Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.

Board Members Present in Conference Room 109: Kevin Kluge, Chairman; Mark Smalley, Danna Quinn

Board Members Present via Conference Call: Rob Lubitz, Jason Hathcock

Also Present: Annette Corallo, Board Secretary; Leticia Chavez, Recorder

Call to Order:

Approval of the Minutes:

November 8, 2016 – Public Meeting Minutes

MOTION: A motion to approve the public meeting minutes of the November 8, 2016 meeting was made by Danna Quinn. Motion was seconded and passed unanimously; minutes stand approved. **CORP 2016-57**

Approval of 2017 CORP Election Process:

Board member Mark Smalley's term will expire on June 30, 2017. Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-893, the Board will conduct an election to fill that position effective July 1, 2017.

A proposed Action Plan to conduct the election was provided for the Board's review and discussion. This plan is based on conducting the election by mail using paper ballots, but the general timelines could also be used for online voting if the Board elects to conduct the election online.

At a meeting on June 2, 2015, the Board discussed the possibility of conducting the election online with the goal of improving member participation. At that time the Board agreed the following factors are essential to use online voting:

1. Availability of email addresses for all officers in every department
2. Reliable transmission of ballot access to all members
3. Assurance of only one vote per member
4. User-friendly voting process for members, to encourage participation
5. Reliable tally of ballot results

The ability to conduct the election electronically relies entirely on the ability to collect email addresses for all eligible officers. All departments must be able to provide email addresses for all

of their CORP members. Board staff will need to review the department lists against the member database to assure that only CORP members receive access to vote. Staff may also have to overcome system rejection of mass emails in the larger counties.

Staff recently researched some available online options for conducting the election (nominations and voting). Documentation from three potential vendors is provided. Using an estimated 2,500 voting members, the estimated costs are:

- Big Pulse: \$1,510
- SimplyVoting: \$1,628
- Survey & Ballot Systems: \$1,799

Board staff costs are not included. Staff time for online voting may be higher than for paper ballots because staff will have to work with the vendor software to design the ballots and manage the election, check department lists against our database records, and possibly input or format member email addresses manually to create a voter database.

For comparison, the estimated cost of a paper ballot election is \$2,330, based on 5000 mailed pieces at .45/piece and one case of specialized paper at \$80. Staff costs are not included for stuffing opening envelopes and counting votes. If the Board directs, staff can further research the cost of using postage paid return envelopes to encourage participation. The option of adding postage to every return envelope sent (about 2500 pieces per round of voting) will add \$1,162 to each round. Another option may be to purchase a permit and pay only for items returned, at a cost of approximately .537/piece. The Board Secretary advised that she did reach out to a company that provides these permits but as of December 6, 2016 has not heard back on the final cost.

A final option, offered by technical support at the AOC, is using Outlook to create a “poll” by including voting buttons in an email message. This could be a no-cost way to conduct an electronic election, but further research is needed on whether the integrity of the election could be maintained using Outlook polling (e.g., one vote per member). The Board agreed to rule this option out as the level of security was a concern.

The Chair stated that the key to electronic voting is obtaining membership email addresses. The Board Secretary stated that, to even consider an online voting process, staff would have to ask each county to provide email addresses for their CORP officers. Local Board staff would then have to verify that the email addresses provided do not include officers for whom the Local Board Office has a waiver on file. The Board Secretary advised that this process could take a month.

The Chair asked if staff could send a membership list to the counties and ask each county to provide email addresses for the officers identified as of a given date. The Board Secretary stated that this could be done, however, due to turn over in the departments, the emails would need to be obtained during the nominations and voting process to ensure only active CORP members receive the election email.

The Board Secretary advised that, at least the first time around, it would be more time-consuming to develop and maintain an electronic voting process. Board member Danna Quinn asked if the addresses the Local Board Office has on file are or would be accurate. The Board Secretary responded that in past elections the rate of return for incorrect addresses was high, but a process is in place to contact the counties for updated addresses and resend the nomination or voting ballots to the affected members.

Board member Rob Lubitz asked what would be the advantage to conducting an online election, i.e., what the Board hoped to address or improve. The Board Secretary responded that the main goal would be to improve member participation in the election.

The Chair stated that, since CORP elections only take place every two years, he would prefer to stay with the paper election process and possibly obtain a permit and pay only for items returned. The Board Secretary advised that since it is mid-fiscal year and the Board has not incurred any major expenses to date, the funds to experiment with prepaid postage or obtaining a permit is something the Board could definitely consider this year.

The Board Secretary also advised that a vacancy in the position of “a designee of the Chief Justice” will also occur on June 30, 2017, when member Kevin Kluge’s term ends. An appointment for that position will be made by May 31, 2017.

MOTION: A motion to approve the election plan for the Board vacancy that will occur when member Mark Smalley’s term ends on June 30, 2017, and to continue the paper election process with the purchase of a permit to pay only for items returned, was made by Jason Hathcock. Motion was seconded and passed unanimously. CORP 2016-58

The Chair stated that if staff was unable to obtain a permit the Board could look into the possibility of providing pre-paid postage on every envelope. The Board Secretary stated that she would obtain more information and provide the Board with an update at its January 3, 2017 meeting.

Approval of Normal Retirement Benefits:

The Local Board may consider and vote on the approval of Normal Retirement benefits for the following applications or defer decision to a later date:

Stanley R. Fosdick
Christopher A. Hodsden
Cynthia B. Pagliasotti
Wanda F. Payne
Andrew D. Wood
Todd Warren

The Board Secretary advised that Todd Warren’s application is submitted for the Board’s approval of a revised benefit to reflect additional contributions paid by Pinal County after it was discovered the county failed to make contributions as required by law during his military service in 1994. Mr. Warren’s revised monthly benefit is an increase of \$13.04 over the benefit approved by the Board on August 2, 2016. Letters between Mr. Warren and the Public Safety Personnel Retirement System were provided to the Board as background for the revision.

Board member Jason Hathcock asked if the benefit the Board approved was effective August 1, 2016. The Board Secretary confirmed the August 1, 2016 date and added Mr. Warren felt he should have been paid retroactive back to April 2016, but PSPRS policy is that they don’t pay retroactive until all contributions are on record, which is typically in the month that the final contributions are posted.

Mr. Hathcock also asked if Mr. Warren’s date of birth was correct, as his letter to PSPRS seems to indicate a 42-year career. The Board Secretary believes Mr. Warren meant 21 years total, but

offered to verify his date of birth. The Chair asked Mr Hathcock if he would like the Board Secretary to follow up on this information. Mr. Hathcock did not request a follow up.

MOTION: A motion to approve the payment of Normal Retirement benefits to the following applicants in about the following amounts, effective December 1, 2016, except as noted, was made by Danna Quinn. Motion was seconded and passed unanimously. **CORP 2016-59**

Stanley R. Fosdick:	\$3,347.28
Christopher A. Hodsden:	\$2,441.33
Cynthia B. Pagliasotti:	\$3,029.02
Wanda F. Payne:	\$3,470.07, effective November 1, 2016; Reverse DROP Estimate: \$142,249.15
Andrew D. Wood:	\$3,710.64
Todd Warren:	\$3,667.05, effective August 1, 2016

Status Update: Membership Audit

Staff has conducted an audit of the Board's membership records against an active membership list provided by PSPRS for the past three years. At the November 8, 2016 meeting the Board approved a motion to request the list from PSPRS to conduct the audit again this year. Staff sent emails to PSPRS on November 15 and November 29 requesting the active membership list but it hasn't been received to date. The audit will begin when PSPRS provides the list.

Acknowledgement of CORP Physical Pre-Existing Conditions:

The Chair noted, for the record, that the physical examination report for member Tyler Prouix identified one or more pre-existing conditions.

Acknowledgement of CORP Physical Exam Final Letters:

The Chair noted, for the record, that a physical examination report for Bo Kim was not received within 60 days of receipt of his membership application and that a final letter requesting an examination was sent to this member via certified mail on November 22, 2016.

Approval of Membership:

The Local Board may consider and vote on the approval of the following requests for membership or defer decision to a later date:

Aguayo, Michelle	Maricopa	9/27/2016
Davis, Zemora	Maricopa	10/17/2016
Escobedo, Jose	Mohave	10/17/2016
Johnson, Annette	Mohave	10/15/2016
Kim, Bo	Pinal	8/29/2016
Mercier, Hannah	Maricopa	11/7/2016
Petersen, Kory	Maricopa	10/10/2016
Potter, Robbey	Maricopa	11/7/2016
Powell, Vernon	Maricopa	10/24/2016

Ramirez, Joel	Cochise	10/24/2016
Soriano, Alexis	Yuma	10/17/2016
Soto, Genoveva	Yuma	10/24/2016
Wells, Tiffany	Mohave	9/26/2016

MOTION: A motion to approve the 13 applicants listed on the agenda for this meeting for membership in CORP pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-893.D and to note for the record that the physical examinations for Jose Escobedo, Robbey Potter and Joel Ramirez identified a physical or mental condition or injury that existed or occurred before the member's date of membership in the plan was made by Rob Lubitz. Motion was seconded and passed unanimously. **CORP 2016-60**

Future Agenda Items:

No items were raised.

Call to the Public:

No members of the public addressed the Board.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:23 a.m.

Transcribed December 6, 2016